# Spectroscopic Studies of Galaxies in the Reionization Era

Richard Ellis (ESO/UCL) 8.8 Dan Stark (Arizona)



October 12th 2015

JWST@ESTEC

8.8

9.5

11.9

9.5

8.6

#### Ground-Space Synergy 1993-2015

#### Hubble Space Telescope





#### Precision/resolved optical/NIR imaging



Spectroscopy (redshifts, physical properties)



Ground-based 8-10m telescopes

### Ground-Space Synergy 2020s: JWST Spectra



JWST spectroscopy will measure stellar continuum & composition of gas in  $z \sim 8+$  galaxies using UV and optical lines longward of 2 microns beyond reach of current & future ground-based telescopes

# Ground-Space Synergy 2020s: ELT AO Imaging



AO will enable TMT/E-ELT to outperform JWST in image quality Unique advantage in imaging rest UV in physically-small distant galaxies

### Planck CMB: Shorter Reionization Era?



Planck Consortium argue the WMAP  $\tau$ , derived largely from TE/EE (polarization) data, is less convincing than the superior TT data from Planck whose degeneracy with the amplitude  $A_s$  can now be broken via CMB lensing constraints.

## **Reionization Era is Already Being Probed..**



ML + 68% Credibility Interval 1.0 Robertson et al. 2013 Forced Match to WMAP r 0.8 0.6 0.4 current 1- Q ⊨ spectroscopic 0.2 limit 10<sup>2</sup> ▲ Ly-a Forest Transmission  $\triangle$  Dark Ly- $\alpha$  Forest Pixels 10<sup>-3</sup> Quasar Near Zone O GRB Damping Wing Absorption  $\triangle$  Ly- $\alpha$  Emitters Ly-α Galaxy Clustering 10<sup>-4</sup> Lv-α Emission Fraction ∓ † † 6 8 10 12 Redshift z

A change of  $\Delta z \sim 1.7$  in instantaneous redshift of reionization makes a big difference to the role of galaxies since their numbers decline very rapidly for z > 6 Adopting  $f_{esc} = 0.2$ ,  $\xi_{ion}$  consistent with  $\beta$ = -2, a LF extending to  $M_{UV}$ =-13 galaxies can account for Planck T with reionization largely contained with 10 < z < 6

Robertson et al (2015) also Choudhury et al (2015), Bouwens et al (2015)

#### **Confirmation: Lyα fraction declines sharply for z > 6**



Schenker et al (2014) – Keck MOSFIRE + UDF, CLASH 7<z<8.2 also Treu et al (2013) – Keck MOSFIRE + BoRG z~8 Finkelstein et al (2013) – Keck MOSFIRE + CANDELS z > 7 Tilvi et al (2014) – Keck MOSFIRE 7<z<8.2 Pentericci et al (2014, 2015) – VLT FORS 6<z<7.3

### **Challenges for JWST/ELTs**

- Through deep and lensed fields, HST has primarily contributed to the demographics of the early galaxy population (#s, LFs, colors..)
- The next step is detailed astrophysics:
  - nature of star formation: regular or burst-like? → feedback
  - ionizing spectrum (stellar populations, role of AGN)  $\rightarrow \xi_{ion}$
  - escape fraction of Lyman limit photons  $\rightarrow$  f<sub>esc</sub>
  - chemical composition: O/H, C/O ratios  $\rightarrow$  earlier nucleosynthesis
  - is there any dust?

#### most of these issues can only be resolved via spectra

• Diagnostic features include both UV and optical lines:

Combination of UV + H $\alpha \rightarrow$  SF timescales z < 6.5[O II], [O III], H $\beta \rightarrow$  O/H ratio and dust content z < 9UV metals  $\rightarrow$  C/O ratio, ionizing spectrum z < 20Ly $\alpha$  detections & profiles  $\rightarrow$  velocity offsets, neutral fraction z < 20

To interpret such new observations requires population synthesis codes incorporating realistic models of line emission from hot stars and AGN e.g. Gutkin et al, Feltre et al 2015

### Constraining Ionizing to UV Photon Ratio $\xi_{ion}$

Contrary to early claims,  $z\sim7-8$  galaxies have normal UV colors but colors alone are insufficient in constraining the ionizing supply factor  $\xi_{ion}$ 

Degeneracies from unknown age, metallicity and dust content!



Dunlop et al (2013)

### **Line Diagnostics**

Low redshift:

Intensity (arbitary units)

SF histories probed via different time sensitivities of UV and Hα luminosities



High redshift: UV metal lines, e.g.

- CIV 1548 Å 48 eV
- O III] 1664 Å 35 eV
- CIII] 1909 Å 24 eV

probe ionizing spectrum and gas phase metallicity beyond z~8



Stark et al (2014)

#### **Important UV Emission Lines**



Two grids of photoionization models predicting nebular emission line ratios: Young stars: CB15 (new tracks, WR stars) + CLOUDY (Gutkin+15) AGN-driven: Power law  $F(v) \sim v^{\alpha}$  + CLOUDY

#### Utility of rest-UV line ratios CIII]/HeII/CIV as discriminants (see Feltre poster)

#### Illustration: CIV Doublet in z ~ 7.045 Galaxy



CIV / Ly $\alpha$  ratio much stronger than in z~2 sample – what does this mean?

- High ionization parameter ( $U_s = \rho_v / \rho_{gas}$ ): log  $U_s \sim -1.35$
- Low metallicity: ~0.01 solar

Conceivably the rarer z > 7 galaxies which reveal Ly $\alpha$  emission are atypical and extreme ionizing sources?

Stark et al (2015)

#### **A New Class of Early Star-Forming Galaxies?**

Most z > 7 galaxies to date were selected primarily on the basis of a strong Lyman continuum drop and a blue rest-frame UV continuum.

But for 7 < z < 9 [O III]/H $\beta$ pollutes the 4.5µm IRAC band. Selecting sources with a strong 4.5µm excess targets intense line emitters

4 such luminous objects (H~25) located in CANDELS fields



Roberts-Borsani et al (2015)

#### **Redshift Records 2015**



#### Also confirmed a third IRAC excess object EGS-z38-2 with Ly $\alpha$ at z=7.477

# Sources with extremely strong ionizing radiation?

```
TABLE 2
```

A complete list of the resulting  $z \ge 7$  sources identified after applying our selection

ID	R.A.	Dec	$m_{AB}{}^{\mathrm{a}}$	[3.6]- $[4.5]$	${z_{phot}}^{\mathrm{b}}$	$Y_{105} - J_{125}^{\rm c}$
COSY-0237620370	10.00.23 76	02.20.37 00	$25.06\pm0.06$	$1.03 \pm 0.15$	$7.14 \pm 0.12$	$-0.13\pm0.66$
EGS-zs8-1	14:20:34.89	53:00:15.35	$25.03 {\pm} 0.05$	$0.53 {\pm} 0.09$	$7.92 \pm \substack{0.36\\0.36}$	$1.00 {\pm} 0.60$
EGS-zs8-2	14:20:12.09	53:00:26.97	$25.12 \pm 0.05$	$0.96 {\pm} 0.17$	$7.61\pm^{0.26}_{0.25}$	$0.66 {\pm} 0.37$
EGSY-2008532660	14:20:08.50	52:53:26.60	$25.26 {\pm} 0.09$	$0.76 {\pm} 0.14$	$8.57_{-0.43}^{+0.22}$	

3/3 sources with  $z_{phot}$  > 7.5 with 4.5µm excess show prominent Lya ! EGSY8p7 at z=8.68 shows Lya where IGM is expected to be ~60% neutral

#### How can this be?

Further evidence z > 7 emitters are a different class of early galaxy with unusually strong radiation fields which have created early ionized bubbles

#### CIII] at z=7.73



Lyα at z=7.73 Oesch et al (2015)

Detection of CIII] doublet – April/June 2015

CIII] 1909/1905 line ratio is a valuable indicator of the electron density and hence, together with UV luminosity can constrain the production rate of ionizing photons.

Stark et al (2015)





#### **Rising Escape Fraction with Redshift?**



Reduced covering fraction of low ionization gas consistent with smaller galaxies, more energetic SF and higher escape fraction:  $f_{esc} < 1 - f_{cov}$ Requires R~2700 stacks or individual lensed sources et al (2012, 2013)



- Lensed z~7.5 galaxy A1689\_zD1 in Abell 1689 (Bradley et al 2008); magnification ~×9
- Low mass (log M\*~9.2) with blue UV slope
- ALMA band 6 (1mm) detection confirmed via 3 independent exposures (log M<sub>dust</sub> ~8)

#### ALMA data on z > 7 LBGs!

# Dust at High z?





#### VLT X-shooter spectrum

#### Lyα still important to detect – even if suppressed

Inferred x(HI) depends on velocity offset of emerging Ly $\alpha$  which may decrease at high z according to MOSFIRE data. Line profiles also valuable probes



# The Holy Grail: Detecting a Pristene Pop III Galaxy?

- Consider halo mass ~ 8 10<sup>7</sup> M<sub>☉</sub>
- Metallicity evolution governed by competition between enriched outflow vs pristene inflow
- Simulations suggest rapid enrichment (< 200Myr) to [Z/H] ~ -3; no low metallicity tail

UNI IKFI Y



Wise et al (2012)

### Summary

- Recent progress supports the conjecture that reionization occurred rapidly and at later epochs than envisaged when JWST was planned, corresponding to 10<z<6</li>
- This increases the likelihood that galaxies were the dominant source of ionizing photons and that the earliest sources are within reach of JWST
- Spectroscopy is the only route to addressing several outstanding challenges in confirming this picture:
  - the nature of the ionizing radiation field
  - the fraction of ionizing photons that escape
  - the nature of early metal enrichment
- Traditional rest-frame optical diagnostics are only available for z < 9 but tools are now available to exploit the rich potential of rest-frame UV lines
- Application of these tools already suggests some z>7 sources displaying Lyα are efficient ionizing sources perhaps indicative of unusual populations of hot stars; thus reionization may be more complex than we imagined